Dovecote Lane point closure: Assessment of alternative options

Option	Advantages	Disadvantages	Does it meet the criteria for ATF funding and national design standards?
Point closure on Dovecote Lane north of West End	 Would remove all bar access traffic from Dovecote Lane. Would remove all bar access traffic from West End and the residential roads to the west of it (improving those existing cycle routes as well). Would address concerns raised by residents of the West End area about transfer of through traffic to their area. Would maintain access for fire and ambulance vehicles from the most direct route. Allows large vehicles to leave the area without the need for a U turn. 	 Only allows access to Dovecote Lane and West End from the A6005 Queens Road. Will add additional traffic to the Station Road junctions with Middle Street and Queens Road. Discussions need to be held with Broxtowe Borough Council's refuse collection teams. 	Yes. Projects specifically supported by the ATF include point closures, which are also recommended in the national design standards.
20 mph speed limit	 Would not affect existing traffic manoeuvres 	 Likely to rely on Police enforcement or traffic calming measures to achieve suitably low speeds. 	No. The ATF requires that projects reallocate road space or introduce point closures. A survey carried out in July 2021 recorded 85 th percentile speeds of 27 mph. A 20 mph speed limit on its own is not likely to reduce traffic speeds sufficiently. Vehicle speeds are considered too high to meet the requirements of the national guidance on setting speed limits without the need for physical measures.



Traffic calming	 Would not affect existing traffic manoeuvres Would reduce vehicle speeds Would discourage rat running 	 Would not guarantee to remove rat running Would adversely impact motorists Would cause noise disturbance to nearby properties Would encourage through traffic to use nearby residential roads and/or the Station Road junctions with Middle Street and Queens Road. Would not adhere to county council policy regarding the circumstances in which traffic calming is installed.
Alternative cycle route using Melrose Avenue, Waverley Avenue and Moore Gate	 Would not affect the existing road network. 	 Moore Gate is extremely narrow (3m wide) and only access traffic is able to use it. Although it is constructed as carriageway with no footway, it functions more as a footway. Encouraging cycle use would not be recommended: the narrowness of the route, the presence of high walls and fencing at the carriageway edge and visibility issues are likely to cause significant conflict with pedestrians and other cyclists. It is not possible to create a safe connection for northbound cyclists wishing to turn east onto Middle Street.
Alternative cycle route using Trevor Road and West End	 Would not affect the existing road network. The volume and speed of traffic are sufficiently low enough that these roads could be signed as a "mixed traffic" routes with a 20 mph speed limit in place. The route is already signed as a cycle route. 	 The road surface is very poor on West End and several adjoining roads, which would offer sub-standard ride quality. The route does not provide access to the play facilities on Dovecote Lane and does not improve cycle access to the railway station. There are concerns about the quality of the route at the West End/Hall Croft junction.
A one-way Order on Dovecote Lane with a	 Would reduce traffic volumes on Dovecote Lane. 	1. Would only reduce traffic in one direction. No.



contraflow one-way cycle lane		 3. 4. 5. 6. 7. 8. 	Traffic flows will increase in one direction on West End and neighbouring roads unless additional measures are put in place there. Will add additional traffic in one direction to the Station Road junctions with Middle Street and Queens Road. Only allows access to Dovecote Lane and Melrose Avenue etc from one direction. Only allows exit from Dovecote Lane and Melrose Avenue from one direction. Part of Dovecote Lane is not wide enough to meet the necessary design standards for a cycle lane. Vehicle speeds may increase due to the absence of oncoming traffic. Short sections of one-way Order can be subject to abuse due to the absence of enforcement. In such instances, motorists tend to drive faster in order to complete the manoeuvre quickly.	Part of the route would not meet the design standards.
Making Dovecote Lane one-way with a two-way cycle track	 Would reduce traffic volumes on Dovecote Lane. 	 2. 3. 4. 5. 6. 	Would only reduce traffic in one direction. Traffic flows will increase in one direction on West End and neighbouring roads unless additional measures are put in place there. Will add additional traffic in one direction to the Station Road junctions with Middle Street and Queens Road. Only allows access to Dovecote Lane and Melrose Avenue etc from one direction. Only allows exit from Dovecote Lane and Melrose Avenue from one direction. Part of Dovecote Lane is not wide enough to meet the necessary design standards for a cycle lane. Vehicle speeds may increase due to the absence of oncoming traffic.	No. The route would not meet the design standards.



Reduce the road width on Dovecote Lane to reduce speeds and deter through traffic	 Would not affect existing traffic manoeuvres Would reduce the amount of on-street parking, which is likely to improve visibility out of private driveways and reduce traffic 	 Short sections of one-way Order can be subject to abuse due to the absence of enforcement. In such instances, motorists tend to drive faster in order to complete the manoeuvre quickly. Changes to the road width would have to be made in line with national design standards. The desirable minimum road width is 5.5m. This cannot be achieved in places north of Manor Road. Road narrowing is not likely to significantly improve the ride experience for cyclists and is not likely to encourage more trips. Some on-street parking would need to be removed. In doing so, the practical road width is likely to increase because parked vehicles narrow the available road space to around 3m. Likely to rely on Police enforcement or traffic calming measures to achieve suitably low speeds.
A lorry ban	 Would maintain existing access arrangements for residents Would reduce the intimidation felt by cyclists 	1. The number of vehicles that are likely to be removed from Dovecote Lane is unlikely to provide a noticeable benefit for cyclists.No. The ATF requires that projects reallocate road space or introduce point closures.
Turning bans at the Middle Street and Queens Road junctions to reduce the amount of traffic on Dovecote Lane	 Banning specific turning manoeuvres (except for cyclists) would reduce the volume of traffic on Dovecote Lane. 	 Banning turning manoeuvres will only allow access from a restricted number of directions. Will be difficult to enforce. The restrictions are likely to be abused and fall into disrepute. No. The ATF requires that projects reallocate road space or introduce point closures.



		 As a result, the number of vehicles removed from Dovecote Lane is likely to be much lower than predicted by traffic counts and may not provide a noticeable benefit. Will add additional traffic to the Station Road junctions with Middle Street and Queens Road. Discussions need to be held with Broxtowe Borough Council's refuse collection teams.
Removal of on-street parking to reduce traffic volumes	 Would increase space for cyclists, making them feel less intimidated 	 The increase in road width would reduce conflict with oncoming vehicles and therefore encourage higher vehicle speeds. An increase in vehicle speeds is likely to increase rat-running, both of which are counter-productive for encouraging cycling. Is likely to move the problem to other nearby residential roads.
Point closure on Dovecote Lane north of Melrose Avenue	 Would remove all bar access traffic from Dovecote Lane. Would maintain access for fire and ambulance vehicles from the most direct route for residents of Melrose Avenue etc. 	 Only allows access to most of Dovecote Lane from Middle Street. Only allows access to Melrose Avenue etc from the A6005 Queens Road. Large vehicles are likely to have to reverse at least 70m in order to U-turn in Leslie Avenue. This will be very unsafe for all road users. Traffic flows will increase on West End and neighbouring roads unless additional measures are put in place there. Will add additional traffic to the Station Road junctions with Middle Street and Queens Road. Yes. Projects specifically supported by the ATF include point closures, which are also recommended in the national design standards. However, the proposal is not considered viable due to concerns about the need for large vehicles to reverse a long distance in order to turn around.



6. May reduce available parking near the
point closure.
7. Discussions need to be held with
Broxtowe Borough Council's refuse
collection teams

