

# **Independent Panel Member Report**

## **Recruitment of the Chief Executive Officer - Office of the Police & Crime Commissioner for Nottinghamshire**

*References in this report to ‘the applicable standards’ are references to the requirements of the s7 Local Government and Housing Act 1989 to appoint a candidate on merit; and to the relevant provisions of the rules set out in HOC 013/2018 on the appointment of Chief Police Officers, which although not directly applicable to PCC Chief Executive appointments, are indicators of best practice in respect of senior public appointments by local policing bodies. The principles adopted include - the requirement to advertise the role for 3 clear weeks; to appoint in a manner which respects the three principles of merit, fairness and openness; and to engage an Independent Member to ensure the selection and appointment process is conducted fairly and openly, and the successful candidate is selected on merit.*

### **Background**

This report is prepared in accordance with the guidelines set out by the applicable standards. It contains my independent assessment of the process followed to appoint the Chief Executive Officer (CEO) to the Office of the Police and Crime Commissioner (OPCC) and comments on whether I have assessed the process to have complied with the four key principles of merit, fairness, openness and transparency and inspiring public confidence.

I have set out below each stage of the appointment process providing commentary where appropriate.

Owing to the current Covid- 19 lockdown restrictions all stages of the recruitment process were carried out remotely.

### **Advertising and Search**

The advert for the role was publicly advertised on Monday 20<sup>th</sup> December with a closing date of Sunday 16<sup>th</sup> January 2022. Advertisements were placed on the NYCC Jobs, Indeed, Nottinghamshire Police and The Association of Police and Crime Commissioners (APCC). In addition, the advert was circulated across the social media platforms including LinkedIn, Facebook, and Twitter.

The table below outlines the activity generated by each of the platforms that were utilised.

<b>Nottinghamshire Police and Crime Commissioner – Final advertising statistics</b>	
<b>Closing date: Midnight 16th January 2022</b>	
NYCC Jobs	Unable to provide view statistics
Campaign site total views to date	581 page views
Indeed	518 views
LinkedIn Job slot	961 apply clicks 12 total views
Facebook Social Media advertising	10 posts 3,198 reach 13 engagements (likes, comments and shares)
Twitter Social Media advertising	19 tweets 2,524 impressions 11 retweets 6 likes
LinkedIn Social Media advertising	8 posts 1,031 impressions 17 likes 13 clicks
<b>Declared Marketing Source</b>	<b>Number of applications</b>
Word of Mouth	4 *
Nottinghamshire OPCC Website	1
Nottinghamshire Police Website	1
Other	1
Not declared	1

\*Word of mouth from OPCC employees and Nottinghamshire Police employees

**I am satisfied that the vacancies were openly and proportionately advertised.**

### **Shortlisting Process**

A total of 10 applicants applied for the CEO role. Each applicant was asked to provide their CV and a statement outlining how they meet the essential criteria of the role.

The shortlisting meeting took place on Tuesday 18 January 2022. The shortlisting panel comprised of:

- Caroline Henry – Police & Crime Commissioner (PCC) – Panel Chair
- Steve Cooper- Assistant Chief Constable (ACC Cooper stood in for Rachel Barber, Deputy Chief Constable on account of DCC Barber being on annual leave)
- Martin Davies - Regional Director, National Probation Service
- Cindy Butts – Independent Panel Member

Panel members present declared which of the candidates they had pre-existing knowledge of, either in a personal or professional capacity. There were some connections, all of which were professional.

The Panel were provided with an initial assessment from North Yorkshire County Council's Resourcing Solutions of the strength of candidates' applications. The shortlisting panel members independently reviewed each of the anonymised 10 applications - assessing each candidate against the published essential criteria for the role.

Having discussed their individual scores and assessments of the candidates the panel agreed a composite assessment for each applicant. Of the 10 candidates reviewed 3 candidates were invited to final interview and 1 candidate was identified as a reserve candidate in the event 1 of the 3 candidates withdrew from the process. One candidate withdrew their application (for personal reasons) before the interview took place.

Prior to interview competency-based interview questions were drafted and the panel approved these as well as a presentation topic which all candidates invited to interview were to be asked to present in 5 minutes without aids.

**I am satisfied that the shortlist process adhered to the principles as set out within the applicable standards and that sufficient focus was paid to verifying and quality assuring the initial scores.**

## **Interview Process**

Interviews took place via Microsoft Teams on 28 January 2022.

### Stakeholder Panel

Prior to final interview each candidate attended a Stakeholder Panel.

The Stakeholder Panel included the following individuals:

- Amanda Sullivan, Chief Operations Office, CCG
- Rev Clive Foster – Community Listening Group
- Yasmin Rehman – CEO Juno Women's Aid
- Gabrielle Jones – Youth Commission

The Stakeholder Panel asked all candidates the same questions.

### Final Interview

The interview panel comprised of the following individuals:

- Caroline Henry – Police & Crime Commissioner (PCC) – Panel Chair
- Rachel Barber, Deputy Chief Constable
- Martin Davies - Regional Director, National Probation Service
- Cindy Butts – Independent Panel Member

Prior to the interviews all panel members were sent Candidate references, declaration of any issues/conflicts the panel should be made aware of as well as a record of publicly available information on the shortlisted candidates.

All candidates were offered reasonable adjustments.

Each shortlisted candidate was offered the opportunity to meet Commissioner Henry to discuss the CEO role and the PCC's priorities and its current programme of activity. All candidates took up the offer.

The panel met in advance of the first interview to finalise the approach and agree which panel members would ask what questions.

All candidates presented for five minutes, following the presentation all candidates were asked the same core questions however panel members were at liberty to ask follow-up questions or specific questions that arose out of the application/CV.

All panel members individually scored candidates following each interview using a pre-prepared individual assessment form. The panel then discussed their individual assessments and agreed on a composite assessment of each candidate's performance.

Prior to making their final assessment on each candidate the panel were given a brief overview of the Stakeholder Panel's views, which included an overall assessment of each candidate, any perceived gaps identified and issues the interview panel may care to consider before making the final decision.

Having taken into consideration all the elements of the recruitment process one candidate is recommended for appointment.

**I am satisfied that the Panel was properly constituted to assess candidates impartially against the full breadth and depth of the requirements of the role.**

**I am satisfied that the Panel effectively managed any prior knowledge of candidates and as such effectively and fairly addressed any perceived conflicts of interest.**

**I am satisfied that the interviews were conducted in a fair, transparent and consistent manner. All applications were assessed against the published criteria and all decisions were fully documented. Fundamentally all decisions were made solely on merit.**

## **Conclusion**

I can report with confidence that the panel has conducted a thorough, objective, and rigorous process and that this report reflects its unanimous conclusion, as such, I am satisfied that this recruitment process met the requirements of the applicable standards.

I would like to record my thanks to all the panel members for the diligent, insightful, and good-humored way in which they approached the process. I would also like to thank Sarah France-Gorton, Penny Keatings and Katy Owen for providing effective logistical support. I am particularly grateful for the support and guidance provided by Julia Mulligan, Independent Consultant and the Head of Resourcing Solutions, Sarah France-Gorton.

**Cindy Butts  
Independent Panel Member**

**31 January 2022**