



meeting	JOINT HEALTH SCRUTINY COMMITTEE	
date	11 November 2008	agenda item number

Report of the Chair of the Joint Health Scrutiny Committee

NHS Annual Health Checks

Purpose of the report

1. To invite Members to consider the findings of the Healthcare Commission's annual health check for NHS Trusts in Nottinghamshire for 2007-08.

Background

2. The Annual Health Check was introduced by the Healthcare Commission in 2005-06 as a new approach to assessing and reporting on the performance of NHS Trusts. The Annual Health Check replaced the previous star ratings assessment system.
3. The health check measures Trusts' performance against 24 core standards which are divided into seven key areas:
 - safety
 - care environment and amenities
 - clinical and cost effectiveness
 - governance
 - patient focus
 - accessible and responsive care and
 - public health.
4. The 24 core standards form the basic minimum level of care that Trusts are expected to provide.
5. Trusts assess their own performance against a number of statements and determine:
 - whether they are in compliance
 - whether they have not met the standard or
 - whether they can provide insufficient assurance either way

and then publish their findings in a declaration.

6. Where a Trust has not met the standard, an action plan must be put in place. The Healthcare Commission will then cross-check the declaration and carry out selective inspections, both random and targeted at those who have identified areas of risk.
7. The Healthcare Commission requires NHS Trusts to seek comments from relevant third party organisations on the Trust's performance against the standards for 2007-08. Invited organisations include:
 - Patient & Public Involvement Forums
 - **Health Overview & Scrutiny Committees**
 - Strategic Health Authorities
8. NHS Trusts are expected to include all third party comments verbatim in their submission to the Healthcare Commission.
9. The Joint Health Scrutiny Committee identified comments for the following Trusts at the meeting in March 2008:
 - Nottingham University Hospital NHS Trust
 - Nottinghamshire Healthcare NHS Trust
10. The County Council Annual Health Checks Select Committee commented on the following Trusts in April 2008:
 - Bassetlaw PCT
 - Doncaster and Bassetlaw Hospital NHS Foundation Trust
 - East Midlands Ambulance Service NHS Trust
 - Nottinghamshire County tPCT
 - Sherwood Forest Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust
11. The City Council Health Scrutiny Panel commented on:
 - Nottinghamshire City PCT
12. The Committees used evidence gathered during previous scrutiny reviews to comment on specific areas of Trust activity, particularly where that work relates to the core standards. The comments are used by the Healthcare Commission as evidence when identifying areas of risk. A copy of all of the comments is available on request or from the County Council's website:
<http://www.nottinghamshire.gov.uk/scrutiny>.

Issues

13. The Healthcare Commission published the Annual Health Check Ratings for 2007-08 on Thursday 16 October 2008.

14. The ratings awarded for 2007-08 are set out in the following table:

Ratings 2007-08

Trust	Quality of services	Use of resources
Bassetlaw PCT	FAIR	FAIR
Nottingham City PCT	FAIR	GOOD
NHS Nottinghamshire County (tPCT)	FAIR	GOOD
Sherwood Forest Hospitals Foundation Trust	GOOD	EXCELLENT
Doncaster and Bassetlaw Hospitals Foundation Trust	GOOD	EXCELLENT
East Midlands Ambulance Service NHS Trust	GOOD	FAIR
Nottingham University Hospitals NHS Trust	FAIR	FAIR
Nottinghamshire Healthcare NHS Trust	EXCELLENT	GOOD

Table 1

Note: Not all the Trusts are the responsibility of the Joint Health Scrutiny Committee. Details of responsibilities are included at Appendix 2. All of the Trusts are shown for the sake of completeness.

15. The ratings previously received by each Trust for 2006-07 are included at Appendix 1.

16. The table below shows how Nottinghamshire Trusts compare nationally:

	Quality of services				Use of resources			
	Weak	Fair	Good	Excellent	Weak	Fair	Good	Excellent
Nottinghamshire	0	4	3	1	0	4	2	2
National (% of all trusts)	20 (5%)	132 (34%)	139 (36%)	100 (26%)	20 (5%)	132 (34%)	145 (37%)	94 (24%)

Table 2

Progress

17. The Overview and Scrutiny Committee may wish to note that the overall ratings are comprised of many sub-categories. An overall rating that has not changed since last year does not necessarily indicate that no progress has been made or that the same level of service has been maintained. Changes to the ratings since 2006-07 include:

- Three Trusts providing services to Nottinghamshire have received a lower rating for quality of services than in 2006-07.
- Three Trusts providing services to Nottinghamshire have improved the rating received for use of resources, two of which previously had ratings of weak.
- One Trust has improved their use of resources rating by two grades.
- One Trust has improved the rating for use of resources whilst slipping one rating on quality of services.

18. The table shows the overall progress of the Trust compared to the ratings for 2006-07:

Trust	Quality of services	Use of resources
Bassetlaw PCT	LOWER (Fair ← Good)	SAME
Nottingham City PCT	LOWER (Fair ← Good)	SAME
NHS Nottinghamshire County (tPCT)	SAME	IMPROVEMENT (Weak → → Good)
Sherwood Forest Hospitals Foundation Trust	SAME	SAME
Doncaster and Bassetlaw Hospitals Foundation Trust	SAME	SAME
East Midlands Ambulance Service NHS Trust	SAME	SAME
Nottingham University Hospitals NHS Trust	LOWER (Fair ← Good)	IMPROVEMENT (Weak → Fair)
Nottinghamshire Healthcare NHS Trust	SAME	IMPROVEMENT (Fair → Good)

Table 3

Nottingham University Hospitals NHS Trust

19. **Nottingham University Hospitals NHS Trust (NUH) has dropped from a rating of good for quality of services to fair.** The quality of services rating is based on three areas:
- meeting core standards
 - existing national targets
 - new national targets
20. NUH has improved its performance against existing national targets but its performance against the core standards has been downgraded. It has received a 'partially met' for the core standards and that has reduced the Trust's overall rating to fair. In 2006-07 NUH received the higher rating of 'almost met' for core standards.

Nottingham University Hospitals Core Standards	
Insufficient Assurance	Not met
<p>C11b - mandatory training (5.3%) Acknowledged by NUH in its declaration Compliant in 2006-07 (87.7%)</p> <p>C18 - equity, choice (1.2%) Compliant in 2006-07 (94.1%)</p>	<p>C02 - safeguarding children (2.4%) Not met in 2006-07 (2.9%)</p> <p>C04b - safe use of medical devices (5.3%) Compliant in 2006-07 (95.9%)</p> <p>C07e – discrimination (11.2%) Acknowledged by NUH in its declaration Not met in 2006-07 (8.2%)</p> <p>C08b - personal development (7.7%) Acknowledged by NUH in its declaration Compliant in 2006-07 (95.9%)</p> <p>C10a - employment checks (2.4%) Not met in 2006-07 (3.5%)</p> <p>C14c - complaints response (4.1%) Acknowledged by NUH in its declaration Compliant in 2006-07 (97%)</p> <p>C17 - patient and public involvement (0.6%) Compliant in 2006-07 (98.8%)</p>

Table 4

Note the number in brackets shows the percentage of trusts nationally achieving the same result
E.g. 2.4% of Trusts did not meet core standard C02

21. The Trust acknowledged in its declaration that standards C7e, C8b and C14c were not met and that there was insufficient assurance to declare full compliance with standard C11b.
22. Three of the core standards were not been met in 2006-07 and 2007-08:
 - C02 - safeguarding children
 - C07e – discrimination
 - C10a - employment checks
23. For each core standard the Trust is required to put an action plan in place, where these are available they have been listed below. Where the Trust has not been compliant for two consecutive years both action plans are listed. The information below also includes the start and completion dates for any action.
24. Members should note that other local acute trusts - Doncaster and Bassetlaw Hospital Foundation Trust and Sherwood Forest Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust - are compliant with all the core standards.

C02 - safeguarding children

How this organisation plans to comply with the standard C02	
Start date 01 April 2006	Finish date 30 July 2007
<p>Issue</p> <p>During 2006/7 the Trust was assured that it had appropriate policies and procedures in place on CRB checks. Evidence (including Internal Audit early in the year) suggested that these policies and procedures were not be fully implemented throughout the Trust. An action plan was implemented which led to improvements but further work is required to ensure implementation is robust.</p> <p>Action</p> <p>Implement and monitor adherence to Trust policies and procedures, notably on CRB checks and checks for new employees and their supervision. Quarterly reports to the Trust's Safeguarding Children and Vulnerable Adults Committee</p>	

25. This core standard was the subject of an inspection carried out by the Healthcare Commission on 11 June 2008. The Trust declared compliance against this standard.

C04b - safe use of medical devices

26. This core standard was the subject of an inspection carried out by the Healthcare Commission on 11 June 2008. The Trust declared compliance against this standard.

C07e - discrimination

How this organisation plans to comply with the standard C07e	
Start date 01 April 2006	Finish date 30 June 2007
Issue There has not yet been organisation wide implementation of the Trust's Race Equality Policy, notably around training and assurance.	
Action Implement enhanced training. Develop and deliver monitoring tool. Ensure accountability for Race Equality training is well understood.	

How this organisation plans to comply with the standard C07e	
Start date 04 January 2007	Finish date 30 December 2007
Issue The Trust's single equality scheme was not approved by the Trust Board until December 2007 and there has been a lack of equality impact assessments. The Healthcare Commission Review of race equality in January 2008 was critical of the lack of engagement mechanisms and commented that there was insufficient career development for minority groups.	
Action The Trust has a Board-approved single equality scheme action plan. The Trust has a detailed action plan, monitored by the Board, resulting from the Health Care Commission Review of race equality. The Trust has appointed a Head of Equality and Diversity. The Trust has established staff and patient engagement mechanisms. The Trust is rolling out equality impact assessments.	

27. The Joint Health Scrutiny Committee may wish to note that 15.1% of NHS Trusts did not meet this standard including NHS Nottinghamshire County.

C10a - employment checks

How this organisation plans to comply with the standard C10a	
Start date 01 April 2006	Finish date 30 July 2007
<p>Issue</p> <p>During 2006/7 the Trust was assured that it had appropriate policies and procedures in place on CRB checks. Evidence (including Internal Audit early in the year) suggested that these policies and procedures were not be fully implemented throughout the Trust. An action plan was implemented which led to improvements but further work is required to ensure implementation is robust.</p> <p>Action</p> <p>Implement and monitor adherence to Trust policies and procedures, notably on CRB checks and checks for new employees and their supervision. Quarterly reports to the Trust's Safeguarding Children and Vulnerable Adults Committee</p>	

28. This core standard was the subject of an inspection carried out by the Healthcare Commission on 11 June 2008. The Trust declared compliance against this standard.

C11b mandatory training

How this organisation plans to comply with the standard C11b	
Start date 04 January 2007	Finish date 30 September 2007
<p>Issue</p> <p>The uptake of mandatory training was poor in the first half of the year with a dramatic increase in the second half of the year. There were also some data recording issues.</p> <p>Action</p> <p>A new induction programme was implemented from 1.10.07. A new mandatory training policy has been introduced. There have been improved levels of recruitment since October 2007 and mandatory training has to be undertaken during the first week of employment.</p>	

29. The Joint Health Scrutiny Committee may wish to note that NHS Nottinghamshire County and Nottingham City PCT did not achieve this standard.

C17 - patient and public involvement

How this organisation plans to comply with the standard C17	
Start date 04 January 2007	Finish date 31 March 2008
<p>Issue Whilst there is clear evidence of patient and carer involvement in the designing, planning, delivery and improvement of Trust services, the Healthcare Commission Review of Race Equality in January 2008 was critical of the lack of engagement mechanisms with BME and seldom heard groups. Consultation with minority ethnic communities on Trust activities, including the Single Equality Scheme was regarded as limited in quality and scope.</p> <p>Action A new PPI lead will be appointed in June 2008 and will be tasked to review existing mechanisms for community engagement and develop a new programme. Central to this will be strategies for engaging all communities and groups particularly those who are seldom heard. The Head of Equality and Diversity (appointed in January 2008) is building links with other organisations in Nottingham and has proposed the setting up of a city-wide diversity practitioners' forum. This will enable sharing of best practice but also provide access to individuals and organisations who can participate in the development of governance and performance management arrangements.</p>	

30. The commentary of the Joint Health Scrutiny Committee included evidence of Nottingham University Hospitals' work in patient and public involvement. The following evidence was submitted:

“A patient reference group has been established to advise the development of the NHS Treatment Centre.

“In conclusion, Ms Cargill [*a representative of the Patient Reference Group*] stated that patients had been involved throughout the whole process of developing the Treatment Centre” - Minutes of the meeting of the Joint City and County Health Scrutiny Committee, June 2007

The Joint City and County Health Scrutiny Committee has been kept aware of the development of the Trust's Five Year Strategic Business Plan which will be instrumental in the development of services during the period which it covers. The Committee receive quarterly updates and are invited to feed comments in to the process. Local Authorities and other NHS Trusts are represented on the External Reference Group which is involved in the development of the Plan.”

31. As the Trust's involvement of patients and the public in planning changes to services is a key area of the Joint Committee's work Members may wish to refer to the comments of the Healthcare Commission when it next considers consultation undertaken by NUH.

C18 - equity, choice

How this organisation plans to comply with the standard C18	
Start date 04 January 2007	Finish date 31 March 2008
<p>Issue Whilst there is evidence that the issue of access to trust services and information for minority ethnic groups has, in part, been addressed, the Healthcare Commission Review of Race Equality in January 2008 concluded that the generalist nature of the single equality scheme has led to systems that do not allow for a distinct enough concentration on the access needs of ethnic minority patients.</p> <p>Action To ensure that our activity is driven consistently, and that progress is measured effectively across the organisation, we are adopting the Equality Standard for local government (ESlg). This is in use across the local government sector and many other areas of the public services, and demands that all our functions should provide a fair and equally accessible service to all people. It will enable us to include the six strands of diversity within related policy, practice and procedure at all levels of the organisation and will ensure continuous improvements are made to all equality practice. It is our aim to meet the highest level of the Standard, Level 5, by the end of 2010.</p>	

32. The Joint Health Scrutiny Committee may wish to note that Nottingham City PCT did not achieve this standard.

Inspection Reports

33. Copies of inspection reports are available on request. The Joint Committee may wish to note that the Healthcare Commission also inspected the Trust on Core Standard C05b - clinical supervision and C11c - professional development and agreed that the Trust was compliant.

Other Targets

34. The Quality of Services rating is also based on the Trust's performance against existing national targets and new national targets.
35. NUH has improved from underachieving against four **existing national targets, to one**. The remaining **underachieving** target is:
- Underachieving - All patients who have operations cancelled for non-clinical reasons to be offered another binding date within 28 days, or the patient's treatment is to be funded at the time and hospital of the patient's choice

36. NUH has improved from underachieving in 2006-07 against the **new national target** to substantially reduce mortality rates by 2010 from heart disease and stroke and related diseases.
37. The Trust is however now reported to be **underachieving** against the following two **new national targets**:
- Underachieving - Achieve year on year reductions in MRSA levels, expanding to cover other healthcare associated infections as data from mandatory surveillance becomes available.
 - Underachieving - Ensure that by 2008 nobody waits more than 18 weeks from GP referral to hospital treatment.
38. The Joint Health Scrutiny Committee is aware of the Trust's work tackling healthcare acquired infection and a further report on this will be presented to Members at the meeting on 10 March 2009.

Discussion

39. Steven Fowlie Medical Director and Danny Mortimer Director of Human Resources at Nottingham University Hospitals NHS Trust will attend the meeting of the Joint Committee to discuss the issues raised in the report.
40. Members may wish to consider how the findings of the Healthcare Commission might impact on patients and the public.

Recommendations

41. It is recommended that the Joint Health Scrutiny Committee
- i. consider the information provided and agree any further information required
 - ii. note the improvement in NUH's rating for Use of Resources

Councillor Chris Winterton
Chair of the Joint Health Scrutiny Committee

Background papers:

Select Committee Response to the Annual Health Checks – April 2008
Joint Health Scrutiny Committee Response – April 2008
<http://www.nottinghamshire.gov.uk/scrutiny>

Healthcare Commission Annual Health Checks 2007-08
<http://www.healthcarecommission.org.uk>

Ratings 2006-07

During 2006-07 a number of Trusts were reconfigured. These Ratings apply to the new Trusts.

Trust	Quality of services	Use of Resources
Bassetlaw PCT	GOOD	FAIR
Nottingham City PCT*	GOOD	GOOD
Nottinghamshire County tPCT	FAIR	WEAK
Sherwood Forest Hospital Trust	GOOD	EXCELLENT
Doncaster and Bassetlaw Hospital Foundation Trust	GOOD	EXCELLENT
East Midlands Ambulance Service NHS Trust	GOOD	FAIR
Nottingham University Hospitals NHS Trust	GOOD	WEAK
Nottinghamshire Healthcare NHS Trust	EXCELLENT	FAIR

*Note: Not all the Trusts are the responsibility of the Joint Health Scrutiny Committee. Details of responsibilities are included at Appendix 2. All of the Trusts are shown for the sake of completeness.

**Comparison
Quality of Services
2006-07 and 2007-08**

Trust	Quality of services 2006-07	Quality of services 2007-08
Bassetlaw PCT	GOOD	FAIR
Nottingham City PCT*	GOOD	FAIR
Nottinghamshire County tPCT	FAIR	FAIR
Sherwood Forest Hospital Trust	GOOD	GOOD
Doncaster and Bassetlaw Hospital Foundation Trust	GOOD	GOOD
East Midlands Ambulance Service NHS Trust	GOOD	GOOD
Nottingham University Hospitals NHS Trust	GOOD	FAIR
Nottinghamshire Healthcare NHS Trust	EXCELLENT	EXCELLENT

*Note: Not all the Trusts are the responsibility of the Joint Health Scrutiny Committee. Details of responsibilities are included at Appendix 2. All of the Trusts are shown for the sake of completeness.

**Comparison
Use of Resources
2006-07 and 2007-08**

Trust	Use of resources 2006-07	Use of resources 2007-08
Bassetlaw PCT	FAIR	FAIR
Nottingham City PCT*	GOOD	GOOD
Nottinghamshire County tPCT	WEAK	GOOD
Sherwood Forest Hospital Trust	EXCELLENT	EXCELLENT
Doncaster and Bassetlaw Hospital Foundation Trust	EXCELLENT	EXCELLENT
East Midlands Ambulance Service NHS Trust	FAIR	FAIR
Nottingham University Hospitals NHS Trust	WEAK	FAIR
Nottinghamshire Healthcare NHS Trust	FAIR	GOOD

*Note: Not all the Trusts are the responsibility of the Joint Health Scrutiny Committee. Details of responsibilities are included at Appendix 2. All of the Trusts are shown for the sake of completeness.

Overview and Scrutiny Committee Responsible for NHS Trusts

NHS Trust	Scrutiny Body Co-ordinating the Response
Bassetlaw PCT	Nottinghamshire County Council Overview and Scrutiny Committee
Doncaster and Bassetlaw Hospitals Foundation Trust	Nottinghamshire County Council Overview and Scrutiny Committee Doncaster MBC Health OSC
East Midlands Ambulance Service	Nottinghamshire County Council Overview and Scrutiny Committee All East Midland Social Services Authority Health OSCs
Nottingham City PCT	Nottingham City Council Health Scrutiny Panel
Nottingham University Hospitals Trust	Joint Health Scrutiny Committee
Nottinghamshire County Teaching PCT	Nottinghamshire County Council Overview and Scrutiny Committee
Nottinghamshire Healthcare Trust	Nottinghamshire County Council Overview and Scrutiny Committee Nottingham City Council Health Scrutiny Panel (Joint Health Scrutiny Committee)
Sherwood Forest Hospitals Foundation Trust	Nottinghamshire County Council Overview and Scrutiny Committee