

# minutes



Meeting	KIRKBY GP SERVICES SELECT COMMITTEE
Date	Monday 16 <sup>th</sup> April 2007 (commencing at 2.00pm)

## Membership

Persons absent are marked with 'A'

## COUNCILLORS

Councillor Yvonne Davidson (Chair)

	John Allin		Pat Lally
A	Ken Bullivant	A	Ellie Lodziak
	Mrs K Cutts		Parry Tsimbiridis
A	VH Dobson		Brian Wombwell

## Co-opted Members:-

	Councillor Rachel Madden	)	
	Councillor Terry Keetley	)	Ashfield DC
A	Councillor Jessie Parker	)	

## ALSO IN ATTENDANCE

Katie Buckle - Head of Planning – Nottinghamshire County NHS Teaching Primary Care Trust (NCtPCT)

Barbara Brady – Nottinghamshire County NHS Teaching Primary Care Trust (NCtPCT)

Dr Place

Dr Aye

Dr Gundkali

Mr & Mrs Stocks

Mr & Mrs Cutts

Ms D Pugh

## MINUTES

The minutes of the last meeting on 16<sup>th</sup> April were agreed and signed by the Chair

## APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

Apologies for absence were received for Councillor Ken Bullivant and Councillor Ellie Lodziak.

## **DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST BY MEMBERS AND OFFICERS**

- (a) Personal
- (b) Prejudicial

Councillor Madden declared a personal interest as a user of GP Services in Kirkby.

### **Change to Local NHS – Improving Access to GP’s in Kirkby-in-Ashfield through Fairness in Primary Care**

Katie Buckle – Head of Planning NCtPCT - provided the Committee with the information they had requested which included a copy of the Consultation Plan, a copy of the Outline Travel Plan for the Ashfield Health Village, details of consultations with staff, and a chart showing the location of the various General Practices in Kirkby in Ashfield and the services they currently offer to their patients.

Councillor Davidson asked Matthew Garrard, Scrutiny Officer, to summarise the views expressed in correspondence that had been received by the Committee. These included:

- A letter from the Patient & Public Information Forum supporting the proposals, with the proviso that the Alternative Provider of Medical Services (APMS) would need to be monitored.
- A letter from the Local Medical Council who were unhappy that the Trust had decided to pursue Option 2 instead of investing in current General Practices in the area and questioned the ability of a commercial provider to deliver the required services. They were concerned that Staff employed by the APMS would forfeit the security of their contracts with the NHS.
- A letter from Drs M & A Siddique who said that, in their view, these proposals were not cost effective and that it would be more beneficial for the people of Kirkby if the money was invested in current local practices.
- A letter from the Mansfield & Ashfield Commissioning Group who reported a lack of consultation and disputed the need for an APMS.
- A letter from Drs Aye & Gundkali clarifying their intentions with regard to their proposed relocation to the new Health Centre in the Ashfield Health Village, possibly merging their practice with Dr McDougall’s or sharing responsibility with them, to recruit additional GPs, to provide extended opening hours and secure cover for intermediate care beds at the Community Hospital site. They noted their concerns about being contracted to a non-NHS Provider, and disputed that they had agreed to become salaried to an APMS.
- A letter from a local resident who felt the proposals would improve the availability of Doctors and benefit the healthcare services for the people of Kirkby in Ashfield.

In view of the amount of information being circulated, Councillor Davidson allowed time for the Committee to read through the paperwork.

Councillor Tsimbiridis stressed the importance of these issues to the people of Kirkby in Ashfield, their right to access proper healthcare services which seemed to have been neglected for some time, and he urged local GPs to work with the Trust to improve the provision in the area.

Councillor Wombwell asked whether the Trust had met with Dr Aye and Dr Gundkali and Dr McDougall's practice to discuss their concerns regarding the APMS. He was aware that an advertisement had been placed in the newspapers inviting interested parties to tender for contracts and asked for reassurance that no decision had been made so far. Councillor Lally suggested that the Trust made clear its view of the earlier discussions with local GPs.

Ms Buckle explained that Ashfield & Mansfield PCT had opened discussions with local GPs about a year ago with a view to investing in local practices, extending and improving health provision in the area and providing enhanced services. However, no agreement on working arrangements with regard to the new practice was reached within the time allowed. The NCtPCT secured the capital funding for the Hospital development plus some additional finance from the Department of Health, and put forward the options for the improved services. Support from local GPs was not forthcoming so the Trust pursued the second option, an APMS and thought it had secured an agreement with Dr Aye and Dr Gundkali to move into the new custom built Health Centre on the Hospital site. The Trust would be meeting with the GPs involved within the next couple of days for further discussions. She assured Councillor Wombwell that no firm decision had, or would be made, regarding the appointment of an APMS until the consultation period had ended and the responses had been considered but, as the tendering process was a lengthy one, the Trust were looking for expressions of interest subject to ongoing consultations. The Trust was aware of the concerns expressed by the GPs about their contracts and pension provision, and were determined that these would be protected within the contracts agreed with the chosen APMS.

Councillor Mrs Cutts asked what the percentages for and against were from the responses received so far, and whether any particular concerns had been noted. In reply, Ms Buckle reported that the responses were generally positive, probably 50/50 for the proposals. Local people were mainly concerned about access to the Health Centre by public transport and related parking issues, whilst GPs were concerned about the APMS. Councillor Allin thought that the Trust could still pursue the first option, but felt that they should also encourage the local Doctors to get together and tender for the APMS as, historically, 75 % of them have so far been awarded to local practices. He insisted that everyone involved had a responsibility to ensure that there was no loss of GP provision.

Councillor Davidson asked for clarification of the situation regarding Byron Ward at Ashfield Community Hospital, reported as empty and ready to be redeveloped into the new Health Centre, but still apparently in use. Ms Buckle explained that it had been out of use for the last year but, due to a major alert in January, the Trust had agreed to open it temporarily.

Councillor Madden was unsure that the proposed Travel Plan would improve access to the Health Village as too much emphasis was being placed on the current parking arrangements in Kirkby in Ashfield, and these were likely to change in the near future, and she advised that the Trust should work with the local council to ensure proper provision of public transport and parking facilities. In her opinion, the consultations were flawed as large sections of the local community had still not been contacted for their views and this would distort the results; she felt that the Trust

should have approached community groups in the first instance to reach the widest audience.

Councillor Davidson invited Dr Aye tell the Committee about the current situation at Kirkby Health Centre. Dr Aye explained that the premises were leased from the Trust, she agreed that they were old and run-down and should be demolished. However, under the circumstances, the Doctors were not sure if the Trust would be willing to assist with relocation, they hoped that the proposed meeting would clear the way forward. Both doctors disputed the Trust's assertion that they had agreed to become salaried to a non-NHS Provider and also did not want to become part of an APMS. They had agreed to consider merging with Dr McDougall's practice and moving into the new Health Centre to provide all the required services.

Dr Place, from that practice, confirmed that the original plan agreed in Autumn 2006, was to develop the Community Hospital, to move in three doctors initially and provide funding for expanding GP numbers and improving the range of services provided, which would address many of the problems faced by patients in Kirkby in Ashfield. He stated that agreement was achieved within the set time scale but later communications brought in the second option of an APMS, which local GP's did not feel they could support even with the Trust's assurances that their contracts and pensions rights would be honoured.

Councillor Wombwell emphasised that this Committee was committed to securing the provision of additional GPs and improved health care for patients in Kirkby in Ashfield and the surrounding area, in a purpose built Health Centre. He was concerned that the situation with Drs Aye and Gundkali had not been settled.

In reply to a question from Councillor Mrs Cutts, Ms Buckle reported that the old Health Centre would be closed over the next two years but assured her that if the Trust could not reach an agreement with the Doctors about relocating to the new Health Centre, they would obviously need to find alternative premises as the primary issue would be to retain the current provision. The contracts with the APMS would be offered on the basis of the development of Byron Ward, the eventual provision of 5 GP's plus a trainee and supporting staff in the new Health Centre, and improve the range of services to patients.

Mrs Stocks, a member of the public present at the meeting, agreed that Kirkby really needed extra doctors but was confused about how this could be achieved using an APMS. Dr Place assured her that, as a patient, who the provider was would make no difference to the care she would receive, that the problem was really between the GPs and the Trust. Councillor Lally urged both parties to re-open discussions.

Councillor Davidson left the room for a couple of minutes and Councillor Mrs Cutts took the Chair in her absence. Matthew Garrard explained that the core issues for the Committee were to decide whether there had been appropriate consultation, whether the proposals were in the best interests of the patients. He confirmed that Members were entitled to ask for changes to the proposals and could make recommendations to the Trust.

## **RECOMMENDATIONS**

The Select Committee agreed the following recommendations:

- The tPCT should immediately contact GPs in Kirkby in Ashfield to explore whether the proposed services and new facilities at the Ashfield Community hospital could be provided
- There should be no loss or reduction of GP provision if the proposals are taken forward, with no current GPs involuntarily displaced
- The tPCT should undertake further work with and encourage GPs in Kirkby in Ashfield to increase the services available to patients
- The tPCT should look for further ways to improve health in Kirkby in Ashfield and that the proposals should not be considered as the only solution necessary
- The tPCT should develop a travel plan that addresses the needs of the Community and reflects the issues of travel, access and parking identified during the consultation
- The tPCT should work in partnership with other agencies to develop the travel plan so that it compliments other work to address wider travel issues in Kirkby in ashfield and the Town's Master Plan
- The tPCT to attend a meeting of the select Committee on 4 June and provide members with the following information
  - Feedback from the responses received during the consultation and how the tPCT has taken on board the issues raised
  - Should the proposals progress, an overview of the tendering process and possible contract terms to be used for the APMS
  - An update on progress of the tPCT working with local GPs

The meeting closed at 4.30pm

**CHAIR**

Ref: Kirkby GP Services) /m\_16 April 2007